

STATE OF TEXAS
 COUNTY OF TARRANT
 CITY OF GRAPEVINE

The Historic Preservation Commission for the City of Grapevine, Texas met in Public Hearing on Wednesday, May 22, 2019, at 6:00 p.m. in the Grapevine City Hall, 2nd Floor Council Chambers, 200 South Main Street, Grapevine, Texas with the following members present to wit:

Sean Shope	Chairman
Vick Cox	Vice-Chairman
Ashley Anderson	Commissioner
Jason Parker	Commissioner
Margaret Telford	Commissioner
Chuck Voelker	Commissioner
Paula Wilbanks	Commissioner Alternate
Paul Slechta	City Council Liaison
Monica Hotelling	P & Z Liaison

The above commissioners constituted a quorum with Commissioner(s) Eric Gilliland absent.

With the following city staff present:

Paul W. McCallum	Executive Director, Grapevine Convention & Visitors Bureau (CVB)
Paula Newman	Managing Director of Administration & Operations
Matthew Boyle	Assistant City of Grapevine Attorney
David Klempin	Historic Preservation Officer
Mary Bush	Historic Preservation Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Shope welcomed all and thanked Council Liaison Paul Slechta, Planning and Zoning Liaison Monica Hotelling, Assistant City Attorney Matthew Boyle and Executive Director Paul W. McCallum for their dedication to Grapevine's Historic Preservation program. He called the meeting to order at 6 p.m.

CITIZEN COMMENTS

Any person who is not scheduled on the agenda may address the Historic Preservation Commission under Citizen Comments by completing a Citizen Appearance Request form. In accordance with the Texas Open Meetings Act, the Commission is restricted in discussing or taking action during Citizen Comments

WORK SESSION

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness as follows:

A. Approved Certificates of Appropriateness as follows:

- #CA19-25 for property located at 428 East Worth Street;
- #CA19-26 for property located at 211 West Franklin Street;
- #CA19-34 for property located at 513 East Texas Street;
- #CA19-35 for property located at 218 West College Street;
- #CA19-36 for property located at 405 South Main Street;
- #CA19-37 for property located at 129 South Main Street, Suite #160.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairman Shope declared the **Public Hearing for #CA19-43** open for the property located at 846 East Wall Street, legally described as Block 2 Lot 7, D. E. Box Addition, City of Grapevine, to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

1. To remove and replace all existing wood windows in the house; and replace with Vinyl windows; and
2. To remove existing rear door and install new metal door; as per the photographs as presented.

Chairman Shope called on David Klempin to present the case.

BACKGROUND:

Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA19-43 was submitted on May 8, 2019 by the applicant, Francisco Murillo, for removal of the original wood windows and installation of vinyl windows. The original house was constructed in 1951 for Norris L. Graham as his family home. The minimal traditional house has a simple rectangular plan. An original one car attached garage at the front of the house to the right of the front door was previously enclosed as living area. The windows were installed without obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness or a permit.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff review of the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Structures Ten Criteria (attached) with regard to the property found the work to be in violation of 1, 3, 4, and 6. To remediate this discrepancy with the Secretary of Interior Standards, staff recommends removal of vinyl windows and replacement with 6 over 6 wood windows and the rear wood door to be reinstalled.

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) **deny** #CA19-43 for removal of existing wood windows replacement with new vinyl windows; and removal of the wood back door and replacement with a metal door.

Mrs. Murillo came forward to speak and apologized for the situation.

Vick Cox moved to close the Public Hearing for #CA19-43; Margaret Telford seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
Nays: 0

Vick Cox made the motion to deny #CA19-43; Paula Wilbanks seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
Nays: 0

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairman Shope declared the **Public Hearing for #CA19-31** open for the property located at 426 East Wall Street, legally described as Lot C, Rawls and Dalton Subdivision, City of Grapevine, to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items.

Vice Chairman Cox left the HPC meeting for this case #CA19-31 at 6:17 p.m.

BACKGROUND:

On June 25, 2018, Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA18-72 was submitted by the applicant, Scott Buchanan of Buchanan Design, to renovate the 1948 Rawls House at 426 East Texas Street and update it for modern living. The total living area of the existing 1,458 square foot house and the 1,941 square foot addition totaled 3,399 square feet, within the 3,400 maximum square feet established by the Preservation Ordinance. The existing covered front porch of 110 square feet and the new covered porch addition of 159 square feet are not to be included in the maximum square feet per the Preservation Ordinance.

The property lot size is 18,629 square feet and the building coverage would be 23%, (maximum 40% lot coverage). Total building size of house with detached garage with storage is 3,994 square feet which is within the ordinance maximum of 4,100 square feet. Building height is 20 feet.

Staff review of the plans relative to the Secretary of Interior Standards found no issues; plans are in compliance with the Secretary of Interior Standards.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended approval of Certificate of Appropriateness #CA19-31 as per the attached plans and drawings: with the conditions a variance be granted for construction of a 700 square foot detached, two-car garage with attached storage; and all exterior materials including roofing, siding and trim, doors and door hardware, windows and light fixtures be staff approved under a separate Certificate(s) of Appropriateness; and a building permit is obtained from the Building Department.

Vick Cox had returned his notification letter of case #CA19-31 to be read into the minutes stating his approval as an adjacent property owner.

Chairman Shope called on the property owner, Dan Bock, for comments. Mr. Bock said the increase in square feet was necessary to house a staircase for safer access to the storage loft.

Jason Parker moved to close the Public Hearing for #CA19-31; Margaret Telford seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

- Ayes: 6 (Shope, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
- Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
- Nays: 0
- Abstains: 1 (Cox)

Chuck Voelker made the motion to approve #CA19-31 with the conditions as presented with the condition of no additional future square footage may be added to this property; Margaret Telford seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

- Ayes: 6 (Shope, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
- Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
- Nays: 0
- Abstains: 1 (Cox)

Historic Preservation Commission Vice Chairman Cox abstained from this item and filed an Affidavit of Conflict of Interest with the Historic Preservation Commission Secretary.

.....

Vice-Chairman Cox returned to the HPC meeting at 6:25 p.m.
Chairman Shope left the HPC meeting for case #CA19-32 at 6:27 p.m.

PUBLIC HEARING

Vice Chairman Cox declared the **Public Hearing for #CA19-32** open for the property located at 513 East Worth Street, legally described as Block 108 Lot 4, College Heights

Addition, City of Grapevine to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items.

Vice Chairman Cox called on David Klempin to present the case.

BACKGROUND:

Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA19-32 was submitted on April 2, 2019 by the applicant, Neal Cooper of Copper Street Homes, to renovate the 1913 Pam Ezell House and update for modern living. The new owners, Joe and Jana Garcia, desire to adapt the house to serve as their family home. The house requires significant updating of the electrical, plumbing and HVAC systems. The plans for the new additions and new detached garage have been developed following the Design Guidelines established for the Ezell property.

The demolition plan indicates the specific walls to be removed from the Ezell House to allow for the new addition on the north side of the house.

Staff review of the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Structures Ten Criteria with regard to this property found the proposed work to be in violation of item 6. To remediate this discrepancy with the Secretary of Interior Standards, staff recommends the new additions be demarcated by the use of a 1" x 6" wood trim board at the point of joining the original one-car garage and the addition on the west elevation; and a 1" x 6" wood trim board be placed at the attachment of the new addition to the original house on the east elevation.

The total living area of the existing 1,492 square foot Ezell House and the 1,122 square foot addition totals 2,614 square feet. This is within the 3,400 maximum square feet established by the Preservation Ordinance. The property lot size is 10,500 square feet and the building coverage would be 31%, (maximum 40%). Building height is 20 feet.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission **approve with conditions** Certificate of Appropriateness #CA19-32 for the property located at 513 East Worth Texas Street, legally described as Block 108 Lot 4, College Heights Addition, City of Grapevine, to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

To renovate and add an addition to the 1913 Ezell House to update for modern living standards and the owner's needs to include the following items:

1. To construct a new one-story addition on the north side of the house to contain a master bedroom and bath; new kitchen and family room; and
2. to construct a new detached 500 square foot two-car garage at the rear of the property;

as per the attached demolition plan and drawings as presented with the conditions all exterior materials including roofing, siding and trim, doors and door hardware, windows, and light fixtures be staff approved under a separate Certificate(s) of Appropriateness; and a building permit is obtained from the Building Department.

Vice Chairman Cox called on the owners to speak. Joe and Jana Garcia came forward with Mr. Garcia saying they were happy to return to Grapevine. They had lived here as newlyweds in 1996 – 97; they now have two adult children and can return for a project for his interior designer wife; their goal in the Township is to blend in, not stand out. Neal Cooper came forward to speak saying this was a house to survive for many more years. Vice Chairman Cox welcomed Mr. & Mrs. Garcia back to Grapevine.

Margaret Telford moved to close the Public Hearing for #CA19-32; Paula Wilbanks seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

- Ayes: 6 (Cox, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
- Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
- Nays: 0
- Abstains: 1 (Shope)

Margaret Telford made the motion to approved #CA19-32 with the conditions as presented; Ashley Anderson seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

- Ayes: 6 (Cox, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
- Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
- Nays: 0
- Abstains: 1 (Shope)

Historic Preservation Commission Chairman Shope abstained from this item and filed an Affidavit of Conflict of Interest with the Historic Preservation Commission Secretary.

.....

Chairman Shope returned to the HPC meeting at 6:39 p.m. after the above vote.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairman Shope declared the **Public Hearing for #CA19-33** open for the property located at 521 South Dooley Street, legally described as Block 1 Lot 1, Weaver Addition, City of Grapevine, to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items.

Chairman Shope called on David Klempin to present the case.

BACKGROUND:

Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA19-33 was submitted on April 24, 2019 by the applicant, Neal Cooper of Copper Street Homes, to remove the existing one-car garage, laundry room and study wing on the north end of the existing house; to replace with a new one-story addition to include a new entry, kitchen, family room and a master bedroom and bath; and to construct a new one and one-half story, 998 square foot, detached two-car garage building with shop and porch, at the rear of the property. The proposed one and one half story structure is 21 feet tall. The property is not landmarked and the owner has not submitted a landmark application for the property.

The owners proposed to expand the home to serve the needs of their family. The existing house was built in 1941 and contains 1,616 square feet of living area and has a 343 square foot attached one-car garage. With the removal of the garage, laundry and study on the north end, the remaining house would be 1,241 square feet. The proposed north end addition would contain 1,811 square feet to total 3,052 square feet of living area.

The existing front porch of 128 square feet; proposed front porch addition of 118 square feet, side porch of 64 square feet and screened porch of 217 square feet; are not to be included in the 3,400 square foot maximum, per the Preservation Ordinance.

At the rear of the property, the proposed one and one-half story, 998 square foot, detached two-car garage building with shop would include a porch of 456 square feet.

The property lot size is 24,400 square feet and the building coverage would be 20.7%, (maximum 40% lot coverage). Total building size of house with detached garage and shop would be 4,050 square feet which is within the ordinance (maximum of 4,100 square feet). Building height is 20 feet.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission **deny** Certificate of Appropriateness #CA19-33 for the property located at 521 South Dooley Street, legally described as Block 1 Lot 1, Weaver Addition, City of Grapevine, to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

1. Streetscape View: The new addition with the remaining portion of the existing house would be 82 feet 11 inches wide along Dooley Street, the house to the north is approximately 35 feet wide and the house to the south is approximately 40 feet wide; the proposed structure would be twice the width of adjoining houses on either side; the removal of the existing study, laundry and garage alters the street scape view;
2. The proposed one and one-half, 998 square foot garage and shop building with

attached 456 square foot covered porch would be very large in relation to garage buildings on adjoining properties which are small two car structures. The proposed structure requires a variance to combine the 500 square foot garage, 200 square foot storage building as allowed by the Ordinance and another 298 square feet from the 3,400 square foot allowed maximum living area. The proposed structure is 21 feet tall. The Historic Preservation Officer, Director of Convention and Visitors Bureau and Building Official recommend denial of the request for a 998 square feet garage with 456 square foot covered porch;

as per the submitted plans.

David Klempin told the Commission that he, Paul W. McCallum and Historic Preservation staff had met with Ryan and Sommer Tate today and a revised plan had been submitted within the City of Grapevine Design Guidelines for property on a wide lot. The 82-foot front façade as submitted had not fit in the streetscape with the north and south neighboring structures each being less than half that wide. The guideline's direction was to make a new addition appear as two structures to reduce massing by retaining the existing house as in the plans and to setback the new addition to appear as a separate structure; the new plan had been submitted in 3D to show the setbacks reduction in the massing.

Chairman Shope asked Mr. Klempin to list the changes made for the new recommended plans for approval by the Commission. Mr. Klempin said as part of the existing house at the front entry, the siding "as shown" on the porch gable would be removed and the gable opened creating the "separation" needed between the original existing house and the new addition. The new proposed addition, as shown on the plans, would have the kitchen porch roof removed and replaced with a flat pergola.

P.W. McCallum said the Design Guidelines for a wide lot direct to try for the appearance of two structures; with the separation of the new addition there are actually two setbacks. The first reflects the original single-car garage; the deep recess between the existing house and new addition setback again-not the continuous 82 feet. The eight-foot wall going 12 feet deep, and another at 30 and 17 feet wide. This plan yielded the look of two separate structures and preserved the original structure. For the variance on the garage, the 24 feet wide garage sits at the back of the property as a positive effect with the board and batten like a nice barn; the depth of the barn is not perceptible. The homeowners have clearly met the Design Guidelines with these changes.

Chairman Shope called on Ryan and Sommer Tate for their comments. Mrs. Tate said they had worked on this for two years since October 2017, they had reconsidered their original plans of going up with a second story and brought forth the one-story plans. They worked to balance what they liked with what the Design Guidelines called for; with a bigger open lot they wanted a nice barn like a Nash Farm barn for their garage/workshop. Mr. Tate said they were both born and raised here and had always wanted to come back to Grapevine's downtown, they are the only family with children in their area making greenspace a big concern for their children to have rear and side

yards, the Dooley Street front yard is not a place for children to play. They do have a long walk to and from their garage but it meant saving a giant oak tree and more greenspace for the kids.

Commissioner Volker asked about the size of the garage, Mr. Tate said he is involved with wood working plus he likes to park his truck in garage and still be able to use for a work area. Commissioner Parker asked about demolition, Mrs. Tate said what they were removing used to be a breezeway which was originally a walkway to the laundry room, a very utilitarian space not usable space and they could not add on to the back or want to go up for living space.

Vick Cox moved to close the Public Hearing for #CA19-33; Margaret Telford seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
Nays: 0

Vick Cox made the motion to approve #CA19-33 with conditions as presented and changes as noted before the Commission; Paula Wilbanks seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

Ayes: 6 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Parker, Voelker and Wilbanks)
Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
Nays: 1 (Telford)

.....

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairman Shope declared the **Public Hearing for #HL19-01** for the property located at 619 South Church Street, legally described as Block 14 Lots 3C & 6A, Grapevine, City of, Grapevine, Texas to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items.

Chairman Shope called on David Klempin to present the case.

BACKGROUND:

On April 24 2019, applicant David Klempin of the City of Grapevine Convention & Visitors Bureau (CVB) submitted an application for Historic Landmark Overlay #HL19-01, for property located at 619 South Church Street, City of Grapevine. The property contains a vacant house and was recently purchased by the Convention & Visitors Bureau for the purpose of extending the Ted R. Ware Plaza and to create the Grapevine International Outreach Museum to highlight and promote Grapevine’s international outreach.

The 1947 Ruby Tillery Moore House is a minimal traditional cottage built in 1947 to serve as the home of Deward R. and Ruby Moore. The house is symmetrical in plan with a small projecting gable covering the front entrance; it contains four rooms and an enclosed porch across the back of the house. The house was continuously lived in by its owner Ruby Moore for 74 years from 1947 until her death. Through the years Miss Ruby developed an eclectic assemblage of plants and figurines.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** the proposed Historic Landmark Subdistrict overlay to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for following properties addressed as: 619 South Church Street.

Staff recommended approval of the Historic Overlay #HL19-01 to record the history of the property and to allow the Historic Preservation Commission to have input in the future development of the property. A set of the proposed Design Guidelines for the property were presented.

Chairman Shope called for questions or comments, there were none.

Vick Cox moved to close the Public Hearing for #HL19-01; Margaret Telford seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

- Ayes: 7 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
- Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
- Nays: 0

Commissioner Wilbanks said she had known Ruby Moore for many years as the parent of one of her the first students when she came to Grapevine to teach, she also worked in the school cafeteria and the drugstore. She said Ruby had a way of being remarkable as she took care of a lot of kids and also worked at McNatt’s Pharmacy; saying it was her pleasure to have known her for a very long time and thank you CVB for saving her house.

Vick Cox made the motion to approve #HL19-01; Margaret Telford seconded the motion prevailing in a vote of:

- Ayes: 7 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
- Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
- Nays: 0

MINUTES

Jason Parker made the motion to approve the minutes of the April 24, 2019 meeting as written; Chuck Voelker seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
Nays: 0

.....

ADJOURNMENT

Jason Parker made the motion to adjourn the meeting; Vick Cox seconded the motion, which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Cox, Anderson, Parker, Telford, Voelker and Wilbanks)
Absent: 1 (Gilliland)
Nays: 0

.....

The meeting adjourned at 7:29 p.m.

Meetings may be viewed at: <http://www.grapevinetexas.gov/1059/Meeting-Videos>

PASSED AND APPROVED BY THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF GRAPEVINE, TEXAS, ON THIS THE 26TH DAY OF JUNE 2019.

APPROVED:


CHAIRMAN

ATTEST:


SECRETARY