

STATE OF TEXAS
COUNTY OF TARRANT
CITY OF GRAPEVINE

The Historic Preservation Commission for the City of Grapevine, Texas, met in Public Hearing on Wednesday, October 24, 2012 at 6:00 p.m. in the Grapevine Convention & Visitors Bureau 2nd Floor Boardroom, 636 South Main Street, Grapevine, Texas, with the following members present to wit:

Burl Gilliam	Chairman
R. Lee Derr	Vice-Chairman
Vick Cox	Commissioner
Sean Shope	Commissioner
Margaret Telford	Commissioner
Ted Ware	Commissioner
Shane Wilbanks	City Council Liaison
Chuck Voelker	Alternate

Constituting a quorum with Commissioner(s) absent: Ashley Anderson and Monica Hotelling, P&Z Liaison

The following city staff present:

Paul W. McCallum	Executive Director, Grapevine Convention & Visitors Bureau
David Klempin	Historic Preservation Officer
Mary Bush	Historic Preservation Secretary

Liaisons present:

Carolyn Ernst	Grapevine Historical Society
Janet Perkins	Grapevine Heritage Foundation

CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

Chairman Burl Gilliam called the Public Hearing to order at 6:00 p.m.

CITIZEN COMMENTS

No comments from citizens were submitted.

WORK SESSION

David Klempin passed around the most recent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness for the Commission to Review.

A. Approved Certificates of Appropriateness as follows:

- #CA12-70 for property located at 804 East Worth Street;
- #CA12-71 for property located at 613 East Texas Street;
- #CA12-72 for property located at 603 South Main Street;
- #CA12-73 for property located at 624 South Main Street.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairman Burl Gilliam opened the **Public Hearing** for #CA12-75 relative to the case for the property located at 116 (120) East Worth Street, legally described as Block 32, Lot 1A1-1B, Grapevine, City of, Grapevine and take any necessary action. Chairman Gilliam called on David Klempin to present the case.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission **approve with conditions** Certificate of Appropriateness CA12-75 for the property located at 116 (120) East Worth Street, legally described as Block 32, Lot 1A1-1B, City of Grapevine to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G - Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

1. Revise the previously approved plans to rebuild the fire-destroyed Cameron Lumber Company Building of c. 1917 using James Hardie cement board siding in place of the brick with the conditions the flat side be facing outward and with a 3 ½" lap exposure; the existing brick-scored wood siding be reinstalled on the west wall of the building in a 12' x 16' inset panel with an interpretive marker explaining its significance; the exterior wood windows and wood doors and all exterior materials, finishes and paint colors shall be Commission approved under a separate Certificate of Appropriateness.

BACKGROUND:

Certificate of Appropriateness application CA12-23 was submitted on May 10, 2012 by Adam Baker of Baker Simpson Holdings LLC and owner of the Lazy Bones Bar & Grill, to demolish the fire damaged structure. A fire had destroyed the original Wm. Cameron & Company building in April 2012 creating a public safety hazard. The building was demolished shortly after the fire occurred with the requirement a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition be obtained and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. At the May 2012 meeting of HPC, the Commission voted to require a Historic Landmark Designation for the property and for the rebuild of the building to be reviewed by the Commission.

On August 8, 2012 the owner submitted application #HL12-05 for Historic Landmark designation and Certificate of Appropriateness #CA12-43 for rebuild of the Cameron building. The plans submitted to reconstruct the building would recreate the site's traditional appearance. At the September 26th meeting the Commission approved #HL12-05 and #CA12-43 for the project. On October 16, 2012 the owner submitted #CA12-75 to revise the previously approved plans to substitute James Hardie cement fiber siding for the brick exterior previously approved by the Commission. The original building was sided with wood and the Hardie siding should be placed to appear as wood siding, with the smooth side facing out and a 3 ½" exposure to match the original wood siding.

Staff recommends the Commission approve #CA12-75 to revise the previously approved plans to rebuild the fire-destroyed Cameron Lumber Company Building of c. 1917, using Hardie board siding in place of the brick with the conditions the flat side be installed facing outward and with 3 ½" lap exposure; the existing brick-scored wood siding be reinstalled on the west wall of the building in a 12' x 16' inset panel with an interpretive marker explaining its significance; the exterior wood windows and wood doors and all exterior materials, finishes and paint colors shall be Commission approved under a separate Certificate of Appropriateness.

Chairman Gilliam asked Mr. Baker for further comments and to answer any questions the Commissioners had. Mr. Baker stated the Commission's previous condition of brick on the rear part of the building seen from the street; the James Hardie board would give the building the continuity of one uniform look for the front and rear of the building.

Commissioner Sean Shope questioned the exposed exterior refrigeration units. Mr. Baker agreed to have his contractor screen the units from street view, saying it would not be a problem to wrap all the way around the units. The Commissioners discussed the symmetry for the location of the historic panel insert from the original building. David Klempin noted the location, as the plans showed, was best. Commissioner Ted Ware agreed saying the panel should stay as one unit and *stand out* to tell the story of the building's history. The side door on the building was questioned; Mr. Baker said at this time it was planned as only an exit, but could be needed to meet the American Disabilities Act (ADA).

Margaret Telford made the motion to close the public hearing. Vick Cox seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

Margaret Telford made a motion for the approval of #CA12-75 with the conditions as presented and the screening of the exterior refrigeration units as agreed. Ted Ware seconded the motion which prevailed in a vote of:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)

Nays: None

Chairman Gilliam announced the Commission's need for a workshop on Design Review Procedures for properties located within the Grapevine Historic Township. Mayor Pro-Tem Shane Wilbanks, as the City Council Liaison to the Historic Preservation Commission, had asked the commissioners to consult on the Commission's review process to present to City Council. Councilman Wilbanks noted as the city and Township move forward the need was greater to protect and preserve Grapevine's heritage. Chairman Gilliam thanked him for his foresight.

As the Township's Historic Preservation Officer, David Klempin reported the statistics he had compiled regarding the recent trend in infill building in the Township and the D.E. Box Addition. He had calculated 295 single family homes, 13 vacant lots and nine double-lots. David said the focus should be on new housing requests, but to temper the size. He had located Plan Sets to help those wanting to move to the Township understand what could be approved by the Commission to fit in with Grapevine's history. Another idea would be a Builder's Kit available at City Hall for the Building Department to share with prospective residents.

Currently, this has become a hot topic due to *looming* or the floor area ratio to lot size. He said a multiplier could be used to ratio square footage, quoting the looming ratio now used in Dallas to reduce wall heights. As another way to retain the neighborhood's history, some committees and boards are using a rule of maximum square footage allowed, such as a 3,500 square foot limit.

The Historic Preservation Commission is responsible for 16 individual platted additions, the information was compiled from the Tarrant Appraisal District records for the year built, living area square footage (not including garages) and climate controlled areas. This information provides the ratio of living area to lot size. The Township's ratios were typically 8 - 20 percent living area to lot size.

New people moving to the Township want to expand living areas which have now factually have become an encroachment. Such examples have been seen at 310 East College Street resulting in a 51.4 percent living area ratio and on a lot only measuring 47 feet wide. Another example at 231 Austin Street is a 44 percent ratio versus the typical 20 percent in the Township. Another example was 405 East Texas with additions of high portion but on a large lot resulting in a 26 percent ratio. These properties have come to the attention of the Commission to see this recent trend.

David had provided these statistics to a consulting attorney specializing in Land Use. Vice-Chairman Lee Derr noted a ratio of 20 percent for a 2,100 square foot home, was a home too small for a modern family; he suggested working toward combining a larger home as long as it was not oppressing a neighbor's property and privacy. Shane stated his fear was five to ten years down the road we will have lost our history having been replaced with all large homes. Commissioner Margaret Telford agreed using the Highland Park area as an example. She

asked for new construction to be compatible with the neighboring homes and not a "square peg in a round hole". Shane said again, he wanted David to present this information to this body (the Commission) for their knowledge and input; the consultant will appear as an independent third party reviewing what is best for the city of Grapevine.

MINUTES

Chairman Gilliam called to consider the minutes as written. Sean Shope made the motion to accept the September 26, 2012 minutes. Margaret Telford seconded the motion, which prevailed by the following vote:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

ADJOURNMENT

Sean Shope made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Margaret Telford seconded the motion, which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

PASSED AND APPROVED BY THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF GRAPEVINE, TEXAS, ON THIS THE 19th DAY OF DECEMBER 2012.

APPROVED:

CHAIRMAN

ATTEST:

SECRETARY