

STATE OF TEXAS
COUNTY OF TARRANT
CITY OF GRAPEVINE

The Historic Preservation Commission for the City of Grapevine, Texas, met in Public Hearing on Wednesday, September 26, 2012 at 6:00 p.m. in the Grapevine Convention & Visitors Bureau 2nd Floor Boardroom, 636 South Main Street, Grapevine, Texas, with the following members present to wit:

Burl Gilliam	Chairman
R. Lee Derr	Vice-Chairman
Ashley Anderson	Commissioner
Vick Cox	Commissioner
Sean Shope	Commissioner
Margaret Telford	Commissioner
Ted Ware	Commissioner
Shane Wilbanks	City Council Liaison
Monica Hotelling	P&Z Liaison
Chuck Voelker	Alternate

Constituting a quorum with no Commissioner(s) absent:

The following city staff present:

David Klempin	Historic Preservation Officer
Mary Bush	Historic Preservation Secretary

CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

Chairman Burl Gilliam called the Public Hearing to order at 6:00 p.m.

CITIZEN COMMENTS

Citizen Comments were heard after the first case on the Public Hearing.

WORK SESSION

David Klempin passed around the most recent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness for the Commission to Review.

A. Approved Certificates of Appropriateness are as follows:

#CA12-56 for property located at 310 East College Street;
 #CA12-57 for property located at 310 East College Street;
 #CA12-58 for property located at 520 South Main Street, Suite 200;
 #CA12-59 for property located at 216 West Wall Street;
 #CA12-60 for property located at 304 East College Street;
 #CA12-65 for property located at 705 North Main Street;
 #CA12-66 for property located at 422 South Main Street;
 #CA12-67 for property located at 424 South Main Street;
 #CA12-68 for property located at 426 South Main Street.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairman Burl Gilliam opened the **Public Hearing** for **#CA12-64** relative to the case for the property located at 520 South Main Street, Suite 203, legally described as Block 4, Lot 1R, 2 & 3B, City of Grapevine and take any necessary action. Chairman Gilliam called on David Klempin to present the case.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission **approve with conditions** the Certificate of Appropriateness #CA12-64 for the property located at 520 South Main Street, Suite 203, legally described as Block 4, Lot 1R, 2 & 3b, City of Grapevine, to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G - Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

1. Install signs for 7 Eleven Market store as follows: one wood carved projecting sign on the front of the building lit by existing gooseneck lights and two wood carved wall signs on the side of the building lit by existing gooseneck lights as per attached plans with the condition that a building permit be obtained from the building department.

BACKGROUND:

Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA12-64 was submitted on September 10, 2012 by the applicant Tony Bologna for proposed signs for a 7 Eleven Market store in Suite 203 of the 520 Main Building. The property is located within the College Street Historic District and is currently landmarked. Staff held a number of meetings with 7 Eleven company representatives and the sign company, Barnett Signs, regarding the signage for the proposed 7 Eleven Market store. Staff suggested a maximum of three colors to be used on the 7 Eleven Market signs including the background color. 7 Eleven representatives were unable to gain approval for this idea from the 7 Eleven corporate office. Therefore, the traditional four color scheme of orange, red and green with white background was submitted for the Commission's consideration. The proposed signs follow the design guidelines established for the College Street Historic District. Through discussions during the meeting process, the size of the wall signs and the size of letters were reduced and the signs became painted wood carved signs. The projecting sign was changed from a rectangular logo sign to a round carved wood sign with a smaller inset 7 Eleven logo.

Staff recommends approval of Certificate of Appropriateness #CA12-64 for the

installation of signs for 7 Eleven Market store including one wood carved projecting sign on the front of the building lit by existing gooseneck lights and two wood carved wall signs lit by existing gooseneck lights as per attached plans with the condition that a building permit be obtained from the building department.

David asked the Commissioners to refer to their agenda packet and note the photographs of signs; he noted the proposed signs were an attempt to follow the historic design guidelines and were not typical of the corporation's usual signage. 7 Eleven representatives presented the proposed signs, a relatively small sign with a 30 inch diameter for the front projecting sign and two signs for the north side of building. David said there would be no backlighting, the signs would be illuminated by the in place gooseneck lamps. He said after many meetings there was still no agreement on the colors, this was 7 Eleven's final version. Commissioner Vick Cox questioned why the corporation would not agree to signage colors as presented in the agenda packet of the brown and beige colors they used in Boston on the 1820 Beacon Hill building. Building owner, Tony Bologna answered the proposed signage had been adjusted to some degree, but this was as far as they could agree. Chairman Gilliam addressed Mr. Bologna regarding the many breaks his building had been given, noting the neon sign for his tenant Jake's Hamburgers. David said at one time, when Main Street had service stations, there were signs with national logos. Commissioner Ted Ware agreed adding there had been Texaco, Gulf and Premier service station signs. David noted 7 Eleven was now proposing a historical type of sign. Ted agreed saying he personally thought they had done a good job and he was a supporter of bringing a 7 Eleven Market to Main Street as he had missed the convenience of having a drug store or hardware store on Main Street; but the Commission's only concern was the appropriateness of a sign. Monica Hotelling agreed this case concerned the sign only.

Margaret Telford made the motion to close the public hearing. Ashley Anderson seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Anderson, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

Ted Ware made a motion for the approval of #CA12-64 as presented. Margaret Telford seconded the motion which prevailed in a vote of:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Anderson, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

CITIZEN COMMENTS

Laura Hoffman (318 East Worth Street, Grapevine) spoke regarding the new construction located at 310 East College Street. She complained of the inappropriateness of the structure as being new construction which is too big for

the lot.

Rhonda Andrews (326 East Worth Street, Grapevine) stated she agreed with Laura.

RETURN TO PUBLIC HEARINGS

Chairman Gilliam opened the **Public Hearing** for #CA12-62 relative to the property located at 523 South Main Street, Grapevine, Texas; he asked David Klempin to present the case to the Commission.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Commission **approve with conditions** Certificate of Appropriateness #CA12-62 for the property located at 523 South Main Street, legally described as Block 16, Lot B & C, City of Grapevine, to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G - Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

Demolish the existing gazebo and replace with a new larger structure; remove existing four-tier fountain and construct a pool with a stream from the original fountain basin running to the new gazebo as per attached plans with the condition all building and landscape materials be approved by staff under a separate Certificate of Appropriateness.

BACKGROUND:

Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA12-62 was submitted on September 12, 2012 by the applicant Paul Knifong to demolish the existing gazebo and replace with a new larger structure; remove existing four-tier fountain and construct a pool with a stream from the original fountain basin running to the new gazebo. The property is located within the College Street Residential Historic District and is currently landmarked. The existing painted gazebo and landscape features were developed over a period of time in the 1970s by the previous owner J. E. Foust. The gazebo was constructed in 1975 and features wood and metal construction on a concrete slab. The structure is non-contributing to the College historic district and is in good condition. The four-tier fountain is a unit that replaced the original one placed there in 1972.

The proposed gazebo would be in keeping with the historic character of the property and the enhancements added by the Foust family. The existing gazebo has been used as a site for family gatherings, and the new larger gazebo would allow seating for up to 20 persons. The proposed water feature would incorporate the basin from the existing four-tier fountain as the headwater source for a stream that flows to a pool by the proposed gazebo. The contractor selected for this project is well experienced at constructing this type of water feature.

Staff recommends approval of Certificate of Appropriateness #CA12-62 for demolition of the existing gazebo, removal of the four-tier fountain and construction of the proposed gazebo and water feature with the condition all building and landscape materials be approved on a separate Certificate of Appropriateness.

David Klempin said the above property was now owned by Stewart Enterprises, Inc., the second largest provider of funeral and cemetery services in the United States. This location's second floor is the headquarters for this region and they desire to improve this property by replacing the existing gazebo with a new period appropriate structure large enough for 20 family members and friends to be able to visit. Mr. Knifong said the proposed stream would have a maximum depth of 12 inches; it would be a low impact improvement and an attractive feature of the property. The sound of birds and traveling water would provide a calming experience with nature. Commissioner Sean Shope questioned if the fountain was the original; Mr. Knifong said the four-tier fountain was not the original, it had been replaced.

Chairman Gilliam called for any questions. Adair Foust was present and asked to see the plans saying she had nothing against the improvements except the existing gazebo was given to her grandmother by Grady Keeling. Ms. Foust concerns were this had been her family's business for years and she is an adjoining property owner. David showed her the plans for the water features which she recognized from other funeral properties. Mr. Knifong told her he had done many features as proposed, for other funeral properties. He addressed her sentiment for the gazebo telling her it was a public hazard as the metal had rusted out and is currently a danger to children climbing on it. He further explained as a design architect he had worked with what was good for the building to be fitting and appropriate. The current owners had asked him to bring water elements to the property, the basin would be shallow. He continued saying the public finds the sounds of traveling water very attractive, there would also be a garden of heirloom plants from the 1930 - 1940's. His contract would include weekly maintenance of the water features installed. Chairman Gilliam called for questions. Vick Cox asked the size of the gazebo; Mr. Knifong answered two feet beyond the present slab.

Margaret Telford made the motion to close the public hearing. Vick Cox seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Anderson, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

Ashley Anderson made a motion for the approval of #CA12-62 as presented. Sean Shope seconded the motion which prevailed in a vote of:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Anderson, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

Chairman Gilliam opened the **Public Hearing** for #CA12-63 relative to the property located at 529 East Worth Street, Grapevine, Texas calling on David Klempin to present the case.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission **approve with**

conditions Certificate of Appropriateness #CA12-63 for the property located at 529 East Worth Street, legally described as Block 108, Lot 7 & 8, City of Grapevine, to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G - Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

1. Relocate house currently located on lots 7 and 8 of College Heights Addition to lot 8;
2. Construct new period-style addition including two bedrooms, master bath, porch and garage as per attached plans with the condition all exterior materials, doors, windows and paint colors be approved under a separate CA and a permit is obtained from the building department.

BACKGROUND:

Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA12-63 was submitted on September 12, 2012 by the applicant Marty Watkins for relocation of the existing Ed & Grady Wood Keeling House currently located on both lots 7 and 8 in the College Heights Addition to lot 8; and the construction of a new period-style addition to include two bedrooms, master bath, closets, porch and garage as per the attached plans. The two lots are landmarked together and are located within the College Heights Addition. Of concern is the fact the Design Guidelines state rearranging the site by moving or removing buildings and site features such as walks, drives and fences which help define the residence's historic value should be avoided. Moving the house to the east would result in creating a buildable lot to the west on which the owner intends to build another house. The Ed & Grady Wood Keeling House was known for its beautiful and spacious lawn and was the site on September 10th 1938 of the wedding on the lawn of their daughter Zena to Gene Oxford as recorded in Grapevine's Most Unforgettable Characters Book.

The new addition would make the house more livable for today's standards.

Staff recommends approval of Certificate of Appropriateness #CA12-63 to relocate the Ed & Grady Wood Keeling House and to construct the proposed addition that has been designed following the Design Guidelines established for the property with the condition that all exterior materials, doors, windows and paint colors be approved under a separate CA and a permit is obtained from the building department.

Should the Commission approve this request; variances from the Board of Zoning Adjustment will be required for: lot width, lot size and front yard setback.

David called on the Commissioners to look at the site plan in their packet and note the house now sits four feet over on to the second lot. The request is to move the house 7.5 feet to the east and 12 feet forward. Ted Ware noted it was common to this neighborhood for the houses to be lined up with neighboring houses. David referred to the plans in the packet, saying the guidelines read to keep the same distance. Ted said we have moved houses all over this town.

This home has had nine owners since 1980. In 1999 GTRP Township Architect, Hugo Gardea had planned to add a master bedroom on the side of the house

and then plans changed to the rear of the house. David complimented Mr. Watkin's house plans as being nice and said it was a direction you could go with. The issue here was opening another lot next door which will mean one more home built into this area and green space lost. Monica Hotelling said it was making it buildable. Scott Williams of Development Services had said if the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) should approve this case, variances would be required. David explained the owner had been working with the Planning & Zoning Department on issues pertaining to the Board of Zoning Appeals for this project. David said the house had been a wedding gift to Ed & Grady Wood Keeling from a family member. Vick Cox asked if the house would survive the move, with Margaret Telford asking about the water, sewer and gas; David said yes, Marty had worked hard on this move. Margaret asked if this doubled the size of the house; David said no, of the 1200 square feet, 600 square feet is garage space. Ted Ware questioned if this proposal would do damage to the Township in regard to the Guidelines; he also questioned the proposal for a second house and its impact on the Township. He said we have moved many houses to lots all over town. College Street has had many houses moved. Ted said he does like this solution of staying at 2400 square feet. Margaret Telford asked about the 18 foot setback; David said many residents are using the rear alley to enter property. Council Liaison Shane Wilbanks said he saw nothing wrong with a smaller house going in except for the open space in this area we are losing; his concern was with the shrinking green space. All Commissioners agreed the need was to maintain the look of the street and avoid another oversized project such as 310 East College from coming in. Another small, period appropriate house would be seen as a great addition. The homeowner, Mr. Watkins assured all he would be making no changes to the front of the existing house, the foundation did need some work but he loved the look of the house and would be preserving it. Vick Cox said he would hate for the Commission to approve this case and then find it could not be moved and have to rebuild if the moving process damaged this treasure. Mr. Watkins assured the Commission he had selected Mr. H. D. Snow to move the house, a plumber and an HVAC technician to check out the house, all saying there would be no problems.

Margaret Telford made the motion to close the public hearing. Ashley Anderson seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Anderson, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

Vice-Chairman Lee Derr called for discussion of the question of someone taking a lot and filling the whole yard with house, his concern was with doubling the size of the existing house. Ashley Anderson said she also questioned the size. David said these are 7,500 square foot small lots, but the 1200 square feet planned is only half living space, the garage is the extra space. Margaret agreed with Lee but said this proposed structure is a one story house and not invasive of the land ; otherwise she would not consider this if it were a 1 ½ - 2 story. David and Ted said the surrounding homes are similar to the same size of the proposed

structure.

Ashley Anderson made a motion for the approval of #CA12-63 as presented. Ted Ware seconded the motion which prevailed in a vote of:

Ayes: 4 (Anderson, Cox, Shope and Ware)
Nays: 3 (Gilliam, Derr and Telford)

Chairman Gilliam announced the vote as 4 - 3, the motion carries.

Chairman Gilliam opened the **Public Hearing** for #CA12-54 relative to the property located at 626 Ball Street, legally described as Block 1, Lot 1, Nash Farmstead Addition, Grapevine, Texas calling on David Klempin to present the case.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Commission **approve with conditions** Certificate of Appropriateness #CA12-54 for the property located at 626 Ball Street, legally described as Block 1, Lot 1, Nash Farmstead Addition, to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G - Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

2. Construct a period-appropriate stacked stone perimeter foundation enclosure under the Nash Farmhouse with the condition that a sample of the stone selection be approved on a separate Certificate of Appropriateness.

BACKGROUND:

Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA12-54 was submitted on August 28, 2012, by the City of Grapevine to construct a period-appropriate stacked stone perimeter foundation enclosure under the Nash Farmhouse. The stone would be dry stacked without mortar. The grade surrounding the Farmhouse would be adjusted to enhance drainage and a subsurface drainage system would be installed to direct water away from the foundation. The Nash Farm Committee at its August 28, 2012 meeting approved the plan to help stabilize the ground conditions under the Farmhouse. It was then approved at the September 19, 2012 meeting of the Grapevine Heritage Foundation Board.

This stacked stone foundation enclosure would prevent the accumulation of rain water run-off under the house, provide stable seasonal temperatures under the house and help stabilize humidity inside the Farmhouse.

Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness of #CA12-54 for construction of a period-appropriate stone perimeter foundation enclosure at the Nash Farmhouse as per the attached plans with the condition that the stone selection be staff approved under a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Ted Ware said the proposed underpinning was not historic to this house. David Klempin showed photographs of other local homes from this era with a stacked

stone underpinning. Ted said this would make the house look different and is not historic to this property. Lee Derr said a pipe and drain system could be used underground beneath the house to catch and carry water away from the structure. Ted said sandstone is the only stone native to this area, and no underpinning materials would be appropriate for the farmhouse. Chairman Gilliam called for more discussion.

Margaret Telford made the motion to close the public hearing. Sean Shope seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Anderson, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

Vice-Chairman Derr made the motion to deny #CA12-54 as stone is not appropriate to this house. Ted Ware seconded the motion which prevailed in a vote of:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Anderson, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

MINUTES

Chairman Gilliam called to consider the minutes as written. Sean Shope made the motion to accept the September 05, 2012 minutes. Margaret Telford seconded the motion, which prevailed by the following vote:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Anderson, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

ADJOURNMENT

Margaret Telford made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Ashley Anderson seconded the motion, which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: All (Gilliam, Derr, Anderson, Cox, Shope, Telford and Ware)
Nays: None

PASSED AND APPROVED BY THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

OF THE CITY OF GRAPEVINE, TEXAS, ON THIS THE
24th DAY OF JULY 2012.

APPROVED:

CHAIRMAN

ATTEST:

SECRETARY